# On linear operators with s-nuclear adjoints, $0 < s \le 1$

#### O.I. Reinov

Saint Petersburg State University
St. Petersburg, Petrodvorets, 28 Universitetskii pr., 198504 Russia

#### **Abstract**

We prove that if  $s \in (0,1]$  and T is a linear operator with s-nuclear adjoint from a Banach space X to a Banach space Y and if one of the spaces  $X^*$  or  $Y^{***}$  has the approximation property of order s, then the operator T is nuclear. The result is in a sense exact. For example, it is shown that for each  $r \in (2/3,1]$  there exist a Banach space  $Z_0$  and a non-nuclear operator  $T: Z_0^{**} \to Z_0$  so that  $Z_0^{**}$  has a Schauder basis,  $Z_0^{***}$  has the  $AP_s$  for every  $s \in (0,r)$  and  $T^*$  is r-nuclear.

*Keywords:* s-nuclear operator, Schauder basis, approximation property, tensor product.

2010 MSC: 47B10. Operators belonging to operator ideals (nuclear, p-summing, in the Schatten-von Neumann classes, etc.)

#### 1. Introduction

We will be interested in the following question from [6, Problem 10.1]: Suppose T is a (bounded linear) operator acting between Banach spaces X and Y, and let  $s \in (0,1)$ . Is it true that if  $T^*$  is s-nuclear then T is s-nuclear too?

As is well known, for s=1, a negative answer was obtained already by T. Figiel and W.B. Johnson in [4]. For  $s \in (2/3, 1]$  the negative answer can be found, e.g., in [14]. Here we are going to give some (partially) positive results in this direction as well as to show the sharpness of them.

It is not difficult to see that if  $T^*$  is s-nuclear, then T is p-nuclear with 1/s = 1/p + 1/2 (see e.g., [13], [14]). This is the best possible general result one can obtain without imposing any conditions on the Banach spaces involved. The sharpness of the assertion 1/s = 1/p + 1/2, for  $s \in (2/3, 1]$ , can be seen, for instance, in [14].

Preprint submitted to Journal of Mathematical Analysis and Applications January 25, 2014

Below we consider a slightly different question: Under which conditions on the Banach spaces involved is it valid that

(\*) an operator  $T \in L(X,Y)$  is nuclear if its adjoint  $T^*$  is s-nuclear?

One of the possibilities for getting some positive answers to (\*) is to apply the so-called approximation properties of order s,  $s \in (2/3, 1]$  (we assume that s > 2/3 since for  $s \le 2/3$  the answer is positive for any Banach spaces; see e.g., [5] or [14]).

We will prove that (\*) is true if either  $X^*$  or  $Y^{***}$  has the  $AP_s$  (Theorem 1). Some examples, given after Theorem 1, will show that these assumptions are, in a sense, necessary (for example, it is not enough to assume that X or  $Y^{**}$  or even both enjoy the  $AP_s$ , not even for s=1). Let us note that the case where s=1 was first investigated in the paper [8] by Eve Oja and the author.

# 2. Notations and preliminaries

Our main reference is [9]. All the spaces under considerations, (X, Y, ...) are real or complex Banach spaces, all linear mappings (operators) are continuous; as usual,  $X^*, X^{**}, ...$  are Banach duals (of X), and x', x'', ... (or y', ...) are the functionals acting on  $X, X^*, ...$  (or on Y, ...). By  $\pi_Y$  we denote the natural isometric injection of Y into its second dual. If  $x \in X, x' \in X^*$  then  $\langle x, x' \rangle = \langle x', x \rangle = x'(x)$ . L(X, Y) as usual stands for the Banach space of all linear bounded operators from X to Y.

An operator  $T: X \to Y$  is s-nuclear  $(0 < s \le 1)$  if it is of the form

$$Tx = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \langle x'_k, x \rangle y_k$$

for all  $x \in X$ , where  $(x'_k) \subset X^*$ ,  $(y_k) \subset Y$ ,  $\sum_k ||x'_k||^s ||y_k||^s < \infty$ . We use the notation  $N_s(X,Y)$  for the quasi-Banach space of all such operators, equipped with the quasi-norm

$$||T||_{N_s} := \inf(\sum_k ||x_k'||^s ||y_k||^s)^{1/s},$$

where the infimum is taken over all representations of T in the above form (see [9, 6.1 and 18.1]). If s = 1, then  $N_1(X, Y)$  is a Banach space, which is usually denoted by N(X, Y). The operators from N(X, Y) are called also

"nuclear operators". It is clear that for  $0 < s_1 < s_2 \le 1$  one has the natural continuous injection  $N_{s_1}(X,Y) \subset N_{s_2}(X,Y)$ .

Every s-nuclear operator is a canonical image of an element of a projective tensor product. Namely, denote by  $X^*\widehat{\otimes}_s Y$  the s-projective tensor product of  $X^*$  and Y consisting of all tensor elements z which admit a representation of the kind

$$z = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} x_k' \otimes y_k \text{ with } \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} ||x_k'||^s ||y_k||^s < \infty.$$

Then every s-nuclear operator from X to Y is an image of an element of  $X^*\widehat{\otimes}_s Y$  via the canonical mappings

$$X^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y \stackrel{j_s}{\to} X^* \widehat{\otimes}_1 Y \stackrel{j}{\to} L(X,Y).$$

Note that  $X^* \widehat{\otimes}_1 Y$  is exactly the projective tensor product  $X^* \widehat{\otimes} Y$  of A. Grothendieck [5]. If  $z \in X^* \widehat{\otimes} Y$  then we denote the corresponding operator (from X to Y) by  $\tilde{z}$ .

We say, following, e.g., [13] or [14], that a Banach space Y has the  $AP_s$  (the approximation property of order s), if for every Banach space X the natural map  $jj_s$  (from above) is one-to-one (note that  $AP_1 = AP$  of A. Grothendieck). It can be seen that, just like for the classical AP, Y has the  $AP_s$  if the natural map  $Y^*\widehat{\otimes}_s Y \to L(Y,Y)$  is one-to-one. Therefore, if Y has the  $AP_s$ , we have  $X^*\widehat{\otimes}_s Y = N_s(X,Y)$  whatever Banach space X we consider. Clearly,  $AP_s \Rightarrow AP_t$  for  $0 < t < s \le 1$ . Every Banach space has the  $AP_{2/3}$  (Grothendieck's Theorem [5], see also [11], [13] or [14]).

Remark 1: Let  $s \in (0,1]$ . If the space Y is a dual space, say  $Y = Z^*$ , then the tensor product  $X^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y = X^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Z^*$  can be naturally (isometrically) identified with the tensor product  $Z^* \widehat{\otimes}_s X^*$  by definition (e.g., we can consider an element  $x' \otimes z'$  also as the element  $z' \otimes x'$ ). It follows that the dual space  $Z^*$  has the  $AP_s$  iff for every Banach space X the natural map  $Z^* \widehat{\otimes}_s X^* \to L(Z,X^*)$  is one-to-one. In this case if  $Z^*$  has the  $AP_s$ , then for any X we have  $N_s(Z,X^*)=Z^*\widehat{\otimes}_s X^*$  and  $N_s(X,Z^*)=X^*\widehat{\otimes}_s Z^*$ . We will use this remark in the proof of Theorem 1 (Section 3).

If  $w \in Y^* \widehat{\otimes} X$  and  $U \in L(X,Y)$ , then  $w \circ U$  denotes the image of w in  $X^* \widehat{\otimes} X$  under the map  $U^* \otimes \operatorname{id}_X$  (see e.g., [5]). So if  $w = \sum \varphi_m' \otimes \psi_m$  is a representation of w in  $Y^* \widehat{\otimes} X$ , then  $w \circ U = \sum U^* \varphi_m' \otimes \psi_m$  is a representation of  $w \circ U$  in  $X^* \widehat{\otimes} X$ . Then trace  $w \circ U = \sum \langle U^* \varphi_m', \psi_m \rangle = \sum \langle \varphi_m', U \psi_m \rangle = \operatorname{trace} U \circ w$ , where  $U \circ w$  is the image of w in  $Y^* \widehat{\otimes} Y$  under the map  $\operatorname{id}_{Y^*} \otimes U$ .

If  $U \in L(X, Y^{**})$ , then the tensor element  $U \circ w \in Y^* \widehat{\otimes} Y^{**}$  is defined by the same way.

Recall that the dual space of  $X^*\widehat{\otimes}Y$  is  $L(X,Y^{**})$  and the duality is defined by the "trace": If  $z \in X^*\widehat{\otimes}Y$  and  $U \in L(Y,X^{**})$ , then

$$\langle U, z \rangle := \operatorname{trace} U \circ z$$

 $(=\sum_k \langle x_k', Uy_k \rangle)$  for a projective representation  $z = \sum_k x_k' \otimes y_k$ . So, the element  $z \in X^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y$  is zero iff it it zero in the projective tensor product  $X^* \widehat{\otimes} Y$  iff for every  $U \in L(Y, X^{**})$  trace  $U \circ z = 0$ . If  $z \in X^* \widehat{\otimes} Y$ , then the corresponding operator  $\widetilde{z}$  is zero iff for every  $R \in Y^* \otimes X$  we have trace  $R \circ z = 0$  (evidently).

Let us mention some examples of Banach spaces with  $AP_s$ : For  $s \in [2/3,1]$  and 1/p+1/2=1/s, every quotient of any subspace of any  $L_p$ -space (and every subspace of any quotient of any  $L_{p'}$ -space) has the  $AP_s$  (as well as all their duals; see, e.g., [13] or [14]; for a more general fact, see Lemma 3 below). Here 1/p+1/p'=1.

All Banach spaces have  $AP_s$  for  $s \in (0, 2/3]$ , however if  $2/3 \le s_1 < s_2 \le 1$  then  $AP_{s_2} \Rightarrow AP_{s_1}$  but  $AP_{s_1}$  does not imply  $AP_{s_2}$ . It is known that for every  $p \ne 2$ ,  $p \in [1, \infty]$ , there exists a subspace (a lot of them) of  $l_p$  without the Grothendieck approximation property; thus, for example,  $AP_1 \ne AP_s$  if  $s \in (0, 1)$ . Indeed, firstly, for  $s \in (0, 2/3]$  any Banach space has the  $AP_s$ , but not every Banach space has the  $AP_1$ . Secondly, for  $s \in (2/3, 1)$  and p with 1/p + 1/2 = 1/s every subspace of  $l_p$  (as was said) has the  $AP_s$ , but there is a subspace of  $l_p$  without the  $AP_1(=AP)$ . Some more information about the statement  $AP_{s_2} \ne AP_{s_1}$  can be deduced from our Examples 1 and 2, as well as Theorems 2 and 3.

We will use later the following facts (surely well known, but maybe not mentioned in the literature):

**Lemma 1.** If  $T \in L(X, Y^{**})$  then  $||T^*|_{\pi_{Y^*}(Y^*)}|| = ||T||$  and  $(T^*|_{\pi_{Y^*}(Y^*)})^*|_X = T$ . So, we may write  $L(X, Y^{**}) = L(Y^*, X^*)$ , where the equality sign refers to the above identification.

**Lemma 2.** Let  $0 < s \le 1$ . If  $T \in L(X, Y)$  then

- 1)  $\pi_Y T \in N_s(X, Y^{**}) \iff T^* \in N_s(Y^*, X^*);$
- 2)  $T \in N_s(X,Y) \Rightarrow T^* \in N_s(Y^*,X^*).$

**Lemma 3.** If E is a Banach space of type 2 (respectively, of cotype 2) and of cotype  $q_0$  (respectively, of type  $q'_0$ ) then E has the  $AP_s$ , where  $1/s = 3/2 - 1/q_0$ .

The proof of Lemma 3 can be found in [13] or [14].

**Lemma 4.** Let  $s \in (0,1]$ . If  $Y^*$  has the  $AP_s$ , then Y has the  $AP_s$  too.

Proof. We use the fact (mentioned above) that Y has the  $AP_s$  iff the natural map  $Y^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y \to L(Y,Y)$  is one-to-one. As is known [5], the projective tensor product  $Y^* \widehat{\otimes} Y$  is a Banach subspace of the tensor product  $Y^* \widehat{\otimes} Y^{**}$ . The tensor product  $Y^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y$  is a linear subspace of  $Y^* \widehat{\otimes} Y$ , as well as  $Y^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y^{**}$  is a linear subspace of  $Y^* \widehat{\otimes} Y^{**}$ . Therefore, the natural map  $Y^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y \to Y^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y^{**}$  is one-to-one. Now if  $Y^*$  has the  $AP_s$ , then the canonical map  $Y^{**} \widehat{\otimes}_s Y^{**} \to L(Y^*,Y^*)$  is one-to-one. Since we can identify the tensor product  $Y^{**} \widehat{\otimes}_s Y^{**}$  with the tensor product  $Y^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y^{**}$  (see Remark 1), it follows that the natural map  $Y^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y \to L(Y,Y)$  is one-to-one. Thus, if  $Y^*$  has the  $AP_s$ , then Y has the  $AP_s$  too.

Remark 2: For any  $s \in (2/3, 1]$  there exists a Banach space, possessing the Grothendieck approximation property, whose dual does not have the  $AP_s$  (it is well known for the case where s = 1). Moreover, if  $s \in (2/3, 1]$ , then we can find a Banach space W such that W has a Schauder basis and  $W^*$  does not

We will use Lemma 4 in the proof of Theorem 1 in the next section.

find a Banach space W such that W has a Schauder basis and  $W^*$  does not have the  $AP_s$ . Indeed, let E be a separable reflexive Banach space without the  $AP_s$  (see [13] or [14]). Let E be a separable space such that E has a basis and there exists a linear homomorphism  $\varphi$  from E onto E so that the subspace  $\varphi^*(E)$  is complemented in E and, moreover, E is complemented in E this (second dual) space E (see [7, Proof of Corollary 1]). Put E is complemented in E this (second dual) space E has a Schauder basis and its dual E does not have the E is

## 3. A positive result

**Theorem 1.** Let  $s \in (0,1]$ ,  $T \in L(X,Y)$  and assume that either  $X^* \in AP_s$  or  $Y^{***} \in AP_s$ . If  $T \in N_s(X,Y^{**})$ , then  $T \in N_1(X,Y)$ . In other words, under these conditions, from the s-nuclearity of the conjugate operator  $T^*$ , it follows that the operator T is nuclear.

Proof. Suppose there exists an operator  $T \in L(X,Y)$  such that  $T \notin N_1(X,Y)$ , but  $\pi_Y T \in N_s(X,Y^{**})$ . Since either  $X^*$  or  $Y^{**}$  has the  $AP_s$ ,  $N_s(X,Y^{**}) = X^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y^{**}$  (see Remark 1 in Section 2). Therefore the operator  $\pi_Y T$  can be identified with the tensor element  $t \in X^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y^{**} \subset X^* \widehat{\otimes}_1 Y^{**}$ . In addition, by the choice of T,  $t \notin X^* \widehat{\otimes}_1 Y$  (the space  $X^* \widehat{\otimes}_1 Y$  is considered as a closed subspace of the space  $X^* \widehat{\otimes}_1 Y^{**}$ ). Hence there is an operator  $U \in L(Y^{**}, X^{**}) = \left(X^* \widehat{\otimes}_1 Y^{**}\right)^*$  with the properties that trace  $U \circ t = X^* \widehat{\otimes}_1 Y^{**}$ 

trace  $(t^* \circ (U^*|_{X^*})) = 1$  and trace  $U \circ \pi_Y \circ z = 0$  for each  $z \in X^* \widehat{\otimes}_1 Y$ . From the last observation it follows that, in particular,  $U \pi_Y = 0$  and  $\pi_Y^* U^*|_{X^*} = 0$ . In fact, if  $x' \in X^*$  and  $y \in Y$ , then

$$\langle U\pi_Y y, x' \rangle = \langle y, \pi_Y^* U^* |_{X^*} x' \rangle = \text{trace } U \circ (x' \otimes \pi_Y(y)) = 0.$$

Evidently, the tensor element  $U \circ t \in X^* \widehat{\otimes}_s X^{**}$  induces the operator  $U \pi_Y T$ , which is equal to the 0-operator.

If  $X^* \in AP_s$  then  $X^* \widehat{\otimes}_s X^{**} = N_s(X, X^{**})$  and, therefore, this tensor element is zero, which contradicts the equality trace  $U \circ t = 1$ .

Now let  $Y^{***} \in AP_s$ . In this case

$$V := (U^*|_{X^*}) \circ T^* \circ \pi_Y^* : Y^{***} \to Y^* \to X^* \to Y^{***}$$

uniquely determines a tensor element  $t_0$  from the s-projective tensor product  $Y^{****}\widehat{\otimes}_s Y^{***}$ . Let us take any representation  $t = \sum x'_n \otimes y''_n$  for t as an element of the space  $X^*\widehat{\otimes}_s Y^{**}$ . Denoting the operator  $U^*|_{X^*}$  by  $U_*$ , we obtain

$$Vy''' = U_* (T^*\pi_Y^* y''') = U_* \left( \left( \sum y_n'' \otimes x_n' \right) \pi_Y^* y''' \right)$$
  
=  $U_* \left( \sum \langle y_n'', \pi_Y^* y''' \rangle x_n' \right) = \sum \langle \pi_Y^{**} y_n'', y''' \rangle U_* x_n'.$ 

So, the operator V (or the element  $t_0$ ) has in the space  $Y^{****} \widehat{\otimes}_s Y^{***}$  the representation

$$V = \sum \pi_Y^{**}(y_n'') \otimes U_*(x_n').$$

Therefore,

trace 
$$t_0 = \operatorname{trace} V = \sum \langle \pi_Y^{**}(y_n''), U_*(x_n') \rangle = \sum \langle y_n'', \pi_Y^{**} U_* x_n' \rangle = \sum 0 = 0$$
 (since  $\pi_Y^{**} U_* = 0$ , see above).

On the other hand,

$$Vy''' = U_* (\pi_Y T)^* y''' = U_* \circ t^* (y''') = U_* \left( \sum \langle y''_n, y''' \rangle x'_n \right) = \sum \langle y''_n, y''' \rangle U_* x'_n,$$
wherea  $V = \sum x'' \otimes U_* (x')$ . Therefore

whence  $V = \sum y_n'' \otimes U_*(x_n')$ . Therefore

trace 
$$t_0 = \operatorname{trace} V = \sum \langle y_n'', U_* x_n' \rangle = \sum \langle U y_n'', x_n' \rangle = \operatorname{trace} U \circ t = 1.$$

The obtained contradiction completes the proof of the theorem.

### 4. Examples

We need two examples to show that all conditions, imposed on X and Y in Theorem 1, are essential. Ideas of such examples are taken from the author's work [13] (not translated, as far as we know, from Russian).

**Example 1.** Let  $r \in (2/3, 1], q \in [2, \infty), 1/r = 3/2 - 1/q$ . There exist a separable reflexive Banach space  $Y_0$  and a tensor element  $w \in Y_0^* \widehat{\otimes}_r Y_0$  so that  $w \neq 0, \tilde{w} = 0$ , the space  $Y_0$  (as well as  $Y_0^*$ ) has the  $AP_s$  for every s < r (but, evidently, does not have the  $AP_r$ ). Moreover,  $Y_0$  is of type 2 and of cotype  $q_0$  for any  $q_0 > q$ .

*Proof.* We will use a variant of Per Enflo's example [3] of a Banach space without the approximation property given in the book [9, 10.4.5]. Namely, it follows from the constructions in [9] that there exist a Banach space X and a tensor element  $z \in X^* \widehat{\otimes} X$  so that trace  $z \neq 0$ , the operator  $\widetilde{z}$ , generated by z, is identically zero and z can be represented in the following form:

(1) 
$$z = \sum_{N=1}^{\infty} \sum_{n=1}^{3 \cdot 2^N} N^{1/2} 2^{-3N/2} x'_{nN} \otimes x_{nN},$$

where the sequences  $(x'_{nN})$  and  $(x_{nN})$  are norm bounded by 1 (see [2] or [9, 10.4.5]).

Fix  $r \in (2/3, 1]$  and put 1/q = 3/2 - 1/r (thus,  $q \in [2, \infty)$ ). Let  $\{\varepsilon_N\}_1^\infty$  be a sequence of numbers such that  $\sum N^{-1-\varepsilon_N} < +\infty$ , put  $\gamma_N = 2 + 3\varepsilon_N/2$  and let  $q_N$  be a number such that  $1/q - 1/q_N = N^{-1}\log_2 N^{\gamma_N}$  (therefore,  $q_N > q$ ). Set  $Y = \left(\sum_N l_{q_N}^{3\cdot 2^N}\right)_{l_{\sigma}}$ .

Denote by  $e_{nN}$  (and  $e'_{nN}$ ) the unit vectors in Y and in  $Y^*$  respectively  $(N=1,2,\ldots;n=1,2,\ldots,3\cdot 2^N)$ , and put

$$z_1 = \sum_N \sum_n 2^{-N/r} N^{-(1+\varepsilon_N)/r} e'_{nN} \otimes x_{nN};$$

$$T = \sum_{N} \sum_{n} 2^{-(3/2 - 1/r)N} N^{(1/2 + 1/r + \varepsilon_N/r)} x'_{nN} \otimes e_{nN}.$$

Let us show that  $z_1 \in Y^* \widehat{\otimes}_r X$  and  $T \in L(X,Y)$ . Then  $z = z_1 \circ T$ . The first inclusion is evident (because of the choice of  $\varepsilon_N$ ).

If  $||x|| \leq 1$  then

$$||Tx|| \le 3 \left( \sum_{N} \left( N^{1/2 + 1/r + \varepsilon_N/r} / 2^{(3/2 - 1/r - 1/q_N)N} \right)^q \right)^{1/q}.$$

Since  $3/2 - 1/r - 1/q_N = 1/q - 1/q_N = N^{-1} \log_2 N^{\gamma_N}$ , we get from the last inequality:

$$||T|| \le 3 \left( \sum N^{(1/2 + 1/r + \varepsilon_N/r - \gamma_N)q} \right)^{1/q} = 3 \left( \sum N^{-1 - \varepsilon_N} \right)^{1/q} < \infty.$$

Hence,

$$z = z_1 \circ T, \quad \tilde{z}: X \xrightarrow{T} Y \xrightarrow{\tilde{z}_1} X.$$

Now, let  $Y_0 := \overline{T(X)} \subset Y$ ,  $T_0 : X \to Y_0$  be induced by T and  $z_0 := z_1 \circ j$  where  $j : Y_0 \hookrightarrow Y$  is the natural embedding. Then  $T_0 \in L(X, Y_0), z_0 \in Y_0^* \widehat{\otimes}_r X, z = z_1 \circ T = z_0 \circ T_0$ , trace  $z_0 \circ T_0 \neq 0$  (so,  $z_0 \neq 0$ ) and  $\widetilde{z}_0 = 0$ .

Write  $z_0$  as  $z_0 = \sum_{m=1}^{\infty} f'_m \otimes f_m$ , where  $(f'_m) \subset Y_0^*, (f_m) \subset X$  and  $\sum_m ||f'_m||^r ||f_m||^r < \infty$ . We get

trace 
$$z_0 \circ T_0 = \sum \langle T_0^* f_m', f_m \rangle = \sum \langle f_m', T_0 f_m \rangle = \operatorname{trace} T_0 \circ z_0.$$

Therefore,  $w := T_0 \circ z_0 \in Y_0^* \widehat{\otimes}_r Y_0$ , trace  $w \neq 0$  and  $\tilde{w} = 0$ .

Since the space Y is of type 2 and of cotype  $q_0$  for every  $q_0 > q$  (and  $Y^*$  is of cotype 2 and of type  $q'_0$ ), the space  $Y_0$  (respectively,  $Y_0^*$ ) has the  $AP_s$ , where  $1/s = 3/2 - 1/q_0$ , for every s < r (Lemma 3).

Remark 3: We have a nice "by-product consequence" of Example 1. For q=2 (that is, r=1), the space  $Y_0$  is a subspace of a space of the type  $\left(\sum_j l_{p_j}^{k_j}\right)_{l_2}$  with  $p_j \searrow 2$  and  $k_j \nearrow \infty$ . Every such space is an asymptotically Hilbertian space (for definitions and some discussion, see [1]). So we have obtained

Corollary. There exists an asymptotically Hilbertian space without the Grothendieck approximation property.

The first example of such a space was constructed by the author in 1982 [10], where A. Szankowski's results were used (let us note that in that time there was not yet such notion as "asymptotically Hilbertian space"). Later, in 2000, by applying Per Enflo's example in a version due to A.M. Davie [2], P. G. Casazza, C. L. García and W. B. Johnson [1] gave another example of

an asymptotically Hilbertian space which fails the approximation property. Here we have got it (accidentally) by using the construction from [9].

**Example 2.** Let  $r \in [2/3, 1), q \in (2, \infty], 1/r = 3/2 - 1/q$ . There exist a subspace  $Y_q$  of the space  $l_q$  and a tensor element  $w_q \in Y_q^* \widehat{\otimes}_1 Y_q$  so that  $w_q \in Y_q^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y_q$  for each s > r,  $w_q \neq 0$ ,  $\widetilde{w}_q = 0$  and the space  $Y_q$  (as well as  $Y_q^*$ ) has the  $AP_r$  (but, evidently, does not have the  $AP_s$  if  $1 \geq s > r$ ). Clearly,  $Y_q$  is of type 2 and of cotype q for  $q < \infty$ .

Proof. We are going to follow the way indicated in the proof of Example 1. Let X and z be as in that proof, so that z has the form (1). Fix  $r \in [2/3, 1)$ . Now 1/q = 3/2 - 1/r, and we put  $\varepsilon_N = 0$  and  $\gamma_N = 2$  for all N; all  $q_n$ 's are equal to q. Let us fix also an  $\alpha = \alpha(q) > 0$  (to be specified later). Consider the space  $Y := \left(\sum_N l_q^{3\cdot 2^N}\right)_{l_n}$  (in the case  $q = \infty$  " $l_q$ " means " $c_0$ ").

Denote by  $e_{nN}$  (and  $e'_{nN}$ ) the unit vectors in Y and in  $Y^*$  respectively  $(N = 1, 2, ...; n = 1, 2, ..., 3 \cdot 2^N)$ , and set this time

$$z_1 = \sum_{N} \sum_{n} 2^{-N/r} N^{\alpha} e'_{nN} \otimes x_{nN};$$
$$T = \sum_{N} \sum_{n} 2^{-(3/2 - 1/r)N} N^{1/2 - \alpha} x'_{nN} \otimes e_{nN}.$$

Then  $z_1 \in Y^* \widehat{\otimes}_s X$  for every s > r. Indeed, if  $s \in (r, 1]$  then

$$\sum_{N} \sum_{n} [2^{-N/r} \ N^{\alpha}]^{s} = \sum_{N} 3 \cdot 2^{N} \cdot 2^{-Ns/r} \ N^{\alpha \, s} = \sum_{N} 3 \cdot 2^{-\varepsilon_{0} N} \ N^{\alpha s} < \infty,$$

where  $\varepsilon_0 = s/r - 1 > 0$ .

We show that  $T \in L(X, Y)$  (clearly, then  $z = z_1 \circ T$ ). Indeed, if  $||x|| \leq 1$  then, for  $q < \infty$ ,

$$||Tx||_{l_q}^q \leq \sum_N \sum_n \left( 2^{-N/q} \, N^{1/2-\alpha} \, |\langle x_{nN}', x \rangle| \right)^q \leq \sum_N 3 \cdot 2^{N-(N/q)q} \, N^{(1/2-\alpha)q} = \sum_N 3 \cdot 1 \cdot N^{\alpha_0},$$

where  $\alpha_0 = (1/2 - \alpha)q$ . Now, take  $\alpha > 0$  such that  $\alpha_0 = -2$ . For  $q = \infty$  take  $\alpha = \alpha(\infty) = 1$ .

Therefore,

$$z = z_1 \circ T, \quad \tilde{z}: X \xrightarrow{T} Y \xrightarrow{\tilde{z}_1} X;$$

As in the case of the previous proof (in Example 1), let  $Y_q := \overline{T(X)} \subset Y, T_q : X \to Y_q$  be induced by T and  $z_q := z_1 \circ j$  where  $j : Y_q \hookrightarrow Y$  is the natural embedding. Then  $T_q \in L(X,Y_q), z_q \in Y_q^* \widehat{\otimes}_s X$  for all s > r,  $z = z_1 \circ T = z_q \circ T_q$ , trace  $z_q \circ T_q \neq 0$  (so,  $z_q \neq 0$ ) and  $\widetilde{z}_q = 0$ .

Write  $z_q$  as  $z_q = \sum_{m=1}^{\infty} f'_m \otimes f_m$ , where  $(f'_m) \subset Y_q^*, (f_m) \subset X$  and  $\sum_m ||f'_m|| ||f_m|| < \infty$ . We get:

trace 
$$z_q \circ T_q = \sum \langle T_q^* f_m', f_m \rangle = \sum \langle f_m', T_q f_m \rangle = \operatorname{trace} T_q \circ z_q.$$

Therefore,  $w_q := T_q \circ z_q \in Y_q^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Y_q$  for every s > r, trace  $w_q \neq 0$  and  $\tilde{w}_q = 0$ . Finally, Lemma 3 says that the space  $Y_q$  has the  $AP_r$  if  $q < \infty$ . If  $q = \infty$  then, as we know, any Banach space has the  $AP_{2/3}$ .

Remark: The space  $Y_{\infty}$  from Example 2 not only does not have the  $AP_s$  for any  $s \in (2/3, 1]$ , but also does not have the  $AP_p$  (in the sense of the paper [12]) for any  $p \in [1, 2)$  (this follows from some facts proved in [13]).

# 5. Applications of Examples

The next two theorems show that the conditions " $X^*$  has the  $AP_s$ " and " $Y^{***}$  has the  $AP_s$ " are essential in Theorem 1 and can not be replaces by the weaker conditions (see Remark 2) "X has the  $AP_s$ " (even by "X has the  $AP_1$ ") or " $Y^{**}$  has the  $AP_s$ "; moreover, even "both X and  $Y^{**}$  have the  $AP_1$ " is not enough for the conclusion of Theorem 1 to hold.

**Theorem 2.** Let  $r \in (2/3, 1]$ . There exist a Banach space  $Z_0$  and an operator  $T \in L(Z_0^{**}, Z_0)$  so that

- (1)  $Z_0^{**}$  has a Schauder basis;
- (2) all the duals of  $Z_0$  are separable;
- (3)  $Z_0^{***}$  has the  $AP_s$  for every  $s \in (0, r)$ ;
- (4)  $\pi_{Z_0} T \in N_r(Z_0^{**}, Z_0^{**});$
- (5)  $T \notin N_1(Z_0^{**}, Z_0);$
- (6)  $Z_0^{***}$  does not have the  $AP_r$ .

*Proof.* Let us fix  $r \in (2/3, 1], q \in [2, \infty), 1/r = 3/2 - 1/q$  and take the pair  $(Y_0, w)$  from Example 1. Let  $Z_0$  be a separable space such that  $Z_0^{**}$  has a basis and there exists a linear homomorphism  $\varphi$  from  $Z_0^{**}$  onto  $Y_0$  with the kernel  $Z_0 \subset Z_0^{**}$  so that the subspace  $\varphi^*(Y_0^*)$  is complemented in  $Z_0^{***}$  and, moreover,  $Z_0^{***} \cong \varphi^*(Y_0^*) \oplus Z_0^*$  (see [7, Proof of Corollary 1]). Lift the

tensor element w, lying in  $Y_0^* \widehat{\otimes}_r Y_0$ , to an element  $w_0 \in Y_0^* \widehat{\otimes}_r Z_0^{**}$ , so that  $\varphi \circ w_0 = w$ , and set  $T := w_0 \circ \varphi$ . Since trace  $w_0 \circ \varphi = \operatorname{trace} \varphi \circ w_0 = \operatorname{trace} w = 1$  and  $Z_0^{**}$  has the AP, then  $\widetilde{w_0} = w_0 \neq 0$ . Besides, the operator  $\widetilde{\varphi \circ w_0} : Y_0 \to Z_0^{**} \to Y_0$ , associated with the tensor  $\varphi \circ w_0$ , is equal to zero. Therefore  $w_0(Y_0) \subset \operatorname{Ker} \varphi = Z_0 \subset Z_0^{**}$ , that is, the operator  $w_0$  acts from  $y_0$  into  $y_0 \in Y_0$ .

Since the subspace  $\varphi^*(Y_0^*)$  is complemented in  $Z_0^{***}$ , we have that  $w_0 \circ \varphi \in Z_0^{***} \widehat{\otimes}_r Z_0 = N_r(Z_0^{**}, Z_0)$  iff  $w_0 \in Y_0^* \widehat{\otimes}_r Z_0 = N_r(Y_0, Z_0)$ .

If  $w_0 \in N_r(Y_0, Z_0)$ , then, for its arbitrary (nonzero!)  $N_r$ -representation of the form  $w_0 = \sum y_n' \otimes z_n$ , the composition  $\varphi \circ w_0$  is a zero tensor element in  $Y_0^* \widehat{\otimes}_r Y_0$ ; but this composition represents the element w, which, by its choice, can not be zero. Thus,  $w_0 \notin N_r(Y_0, Z_0)$  and, thereby,  $w_0 \circ \varphi \notin Z_0^{***} \widehat{\otimes}_r Z_0 = N_r(Z_0^{**}, Z_0)$ . On the other hand, certainly,  $w_0 \circ \varphi \in Z_0^{***} \widehat{\otimes}_r Z_0^{**} = N_r(Z_0^{**}, Z_0^{**})$ .

Finally, since  $Z_0^{***} \cong \varphi^*(Y_0^*) \oplus Z_0^*$ , one has that the space  $Z_0^{***}$  has the  $AP_s$  for every  $s \in (0, r)$ .

**Theorem 3.** Let  $r \in [2/3, 1), q \in (2, \infty], 1/r = 3/2 - 1/q$ . There exist a Banach space  $Z_q$  and an operator  $T \in L(Z_q^{**}, Z_q)$  so that

- (1)  $Z_q^{**}$  has a Schauder basis;
- (2) if  $q < \infty$ , then all the duals of  $Z_q$  are separable;
- (3)  $Z_q^{***}$  has the  $AP_r$ ;
- (4)  $\pi_{Z_q}^T T \in N_s(Z_q^{**}, Z_q^{**})$  for every  $s \in (r, 1]$ ;
- (5)  $T \notin N_1(Z_q^{**}, Z_q);$
- (6)  $Z_q^{***}$  does not have the  $AP_s$  for any  $s \in (r, 1]$ ;

Proof. Let us fix  $r \in [2/3, 1), q \in (2, \infty], 1/r = 3/2 - 1/q$  and take the pair  $(Y_q, w_q)$  from Example 2. Let  $Z_q$  be a separable space such that  $Z_q^{**}$  has a basis and there exists a linear homomorphism  $\varphi$  from  $Z_q^{**}$  onto  $Y_q$  with the kernel  $Z_q \subset Z_q^{**}$  so that the subspace  $\varphi^*(Y_q^*)$  is complemented in  $Z_q^{***}$  and, moreover,  $Z_q^{***} \cong \varphi^*(Y_q^*) \oplus Z_q^*$  (as in the proof of Theorem 2, see [7, Proof of Corollary 1]).

Construct  $w_0 \in Y_q^* \widehat{\otimes}_1 Z_q^{**}$  (following the way of the proof of Theorem 2) so that  $w_0 \in Y_q^* \widehat{\otimes}_s Z_q^{**}$  for every  $s \in (r, 1]$  and  $\varphi \circ w_0 = w_q$  (it is possible to apply a "simultaneous lifting" procedure — see Footnote 1 — since w has a form from the proof of the assertion of Example 2). Set  $T := w_0 \circ \varphi$ . From

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>If  $w = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} y_k' \otimes y_k$  is any representation of w in  $Y_0^* \widehat{\otimes}_r Y_0$  with  $(y_k) \in l_r(Y_0)$ , then we take  $\{z_n''\} \subset Z_0^{**}$  in such a way that the last sequence is absolutely r-summing and  $\varphi(z_n'') = y_n$  for every n.

this point, the proof repeats the arguments of the proof of Theorem 2, and we have to mention only: since  $Z_q^{***} \cong \varphi^*(Y_q^*) \oplus Z_q^*$ , one has that the space  $Z_q^{***}$  has the  $AP_r$ .

#### References

- [1] P. G. Casazza, C. L. García, W. B. Johnson, An example of an asymptotically Hilbertian space which fails the approximation property, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc., Volume 129, No. 10 (2001), 3017-3024.
- [2] A.M. Davie, The approximation problem for Banach spaces, Bull. London Math. Soc., Volume 5 (1973), 261–266.
- [3] P. Enflo, A counterexample to the approximation property in Banach spaces, Acta Math., Volume 130 (1973), 309–317.
- [4] T. Figiel, W.B. Johnson, The approximation property does not imply the bounded approximation property, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc., Volume 41 (1973), 197–200.
- [5] A. Grothendieck, Produits tensoriels topologiques et espases nucléaires, Mem. Amer. Math. Soc., Volume 16, 1955, 196 + 140.
- [6] A. Hinrichs, A. Pietsch, p-nuclear operators in the sense of Grothendieck, Math. Nachr., Volume 283, No. 2 (2010), 232–261.
- [7] J. Lindenstrauss, On James' paper "Separable Conjugate Spaces", Israel J. Math., Volume 9 (1971), 279–284.
- [8] E. Oja, O.I. Reinov, Un contre-exemple à une affirmation de A.Grothendieck, C. R. Acad. Sc. Paris. — Serie I, Volume 305 (1987), 121–122.
- [9] A. Pietsch, Operator ideals, North-Holland, 1978.
- [10] O. I. Reinov, Banach spaces without approximation property, Functional Analysis and Its Applications, Volume 16, No. 4 (1982), 315-317.
- [11] O.I. Reinov, A simple proof of two theorems of A. Grothendieck, Vestn. Leningr. Univ., Volume 7 (1983), 115-116.

- [12] O.I. Reinov, Approximation properties of order p and the existence of non-p-nuclear operators with p-nuclear second adjoints, Math. Nachr., Volume 109 (1982), 125-134.
- [13] O. I. Reinov, Disappearing tensor elements in the scale of p-nuclear operators, in: Theory of Operators and Theory of Functions, Leningrad, LGU, Volume 1 (1983), 145-165.
- [14] O.I. Reinov, Approximation properties AP<sub>s</sub> and p-nuclear operators (the case  $0 < s \le 1$ ), Journal of Mathematical Sciences, Volume 115, No. 2 (2003), 2243-2250.

Reinov Oleg St. Petersburg State University, 198504 St. Petersburg, Petrodvorets, 28 Universitetskii pr., Russia E-mail address: orein51@mail.ru